

Globalisation and Localisation: Pentecostals and Anglicans in Australia and the United States¹

Gary D. Bouma

Pentecostals and Anglicans around the world represent archetypes of two different forms of the globalisation of religious organisation belief and practice. Anglican globalisation was, and may still be, tied to the expansion and recession of the British Empire. Anglicanism spread with the Empire, was associated with colonial and military leadership and now appears to be receding as that empire recedes. Contrast this with Pentecostal globalisation, which has not resulted from either migration or the expansions of geo-political empire but through conversion, the use of media and non-power based involvement in the local. Comparing these two groups as they are found in Australia and the United States provides evidence for these two archetypes and of the impact of local socio-cultural forces on the ways in which the global becomes embedded in the local. The comparison also makes clear the differences in missiological strategy between modernity and post-modernity, proselytisation and conversion.

A Demographic and Social Institutions Framework

Two dimensions need to be kept in mind when comparing the religious life of various societies such as the United States and Australia - how do their religious demographics differ and how do their religious institutions differ.² The demographic dimension sets the context for localisation by ascertaining the relative size of various religious groups over time and by mapping trends in the

¹ This paper grows out of research supported by a grant from the Monash University Research Fund 1999. Significant data collection occurred in the Southwest of the United States in June/July 1999, in Chicago and Boston in October 1999 and in Massachusetts and Tasmania in November 1999. An earlier version was presented to the annual meetings of the Australian Association for the Study of Religions, University of Sydney, Sept 30 - Oct 3 1999.

² G. D. Bouma, 'Distinguishing Institutions and Organisations in Social Change,' *Journal of Sociology*, Vol. 34, No. 3, 1998, pp. 232-44.

The End of Religions? Religion in an Age of Globalisation

shifting religious composition of societies. A society's religious institution refers to the basic assumptions and expectations it holds about the practice of religion.¹ The intertwining influence of demographic and institutional dimensions in globalisation and localisation is outlined below. Both globalisation and localisation of religious forms are shaped by the religious institution within which a new form emerges and/or from which a form is spread. Similarly, the way in which the form is localised will depend on the religious institution of the society to which it is spread by globalisation.

A second aspect of religious institutions useful in comparative studies of world wide religious processes has been the direction of religious change which in general is from the Rational toward the Charismatic.² This change is particularly clear in the United States and is made evident not only in the growing numbers associated with Pentecostal groups, but by the appearance of Pentecostal assemblies in every small town, including a rapid rise among indigenous populations. Towns of less than one thousand have one assembly, but larger towns are likely to have more. Even traditionally Mormon towns in the state of Utah sport competing Pentecostal assemblies. In Australia the direction of religious change has been from Rational toward Traditional³ but this has been much tempered by the inclusion within the 'episcopal' of significant Charismatic elements. Whereas in Australia the pre-1947 tension would have been between Traditional and Rational dimensions, the current tension is between Traditional and Charismatic⁴. The story of these changes provides an example of globalisation and localisation.

Comparing the United States and Australia

First, from a demographic perspective, at present, Anglicans are proportionately the same size in the United States as Pentecostals are in Australia (about 1 percent), and Anglicans in Australia and

¹ *Loc. cit.*

² See G. D. Bouma, *Religion: Meaning, Transcendence and Community in Australia*, 1992, Melbourne, Longman Cheshire, ch 5; and G. D. Bouma 'By What Authority? An Analysis of the Locus of Ultimate Authority in Ecclesiastical Organisations', in A. Black (ed.), *Religion in Australia*, Sydney, 1991, pp. 121-31.

³ *Loc. cit.*

⁴ See P. D. Ballis and G. D. Bouma (eds), *Religion in an Age of Change*, Melbourne, 1999.

Globalisation and Localisation

Pentecostals in the United States are just over 20%. When this fact is taken alongside the fact that Catholics are about the same proportion in the United States and Australia (between 27% and 33%), the effect of these differences is amplified. With the Pentecostal proportion augmenting the mainline Protestant proportions adding to about 50%, the religious demography of the United States is predominantly Protestant. This demographic fact is reflected in, and augmented by, the fact that the religious institution of the United States is distinctly Protestant. A Protestant religious institution is characterised by a preaching-dominated form of worship conducted by practitioners usually referred to as 'pastors' or 'ministers' who practice within democratically organised structures characterised by denominationalism in which there is a high level of respect among religious organisations and limited competition between them. This form of religious institution became the dominant ethos or religious institution in the American Colonies and has both characterised and shaped American religious life since the Massachusetts Bay Colony, and in its modern form since the Revolutionary War.

In contrast, Australia's dominant religious demography and institution ethos is distinctly 'episcopal'. An episcopal religious institution is characterised by sacramentally focussed worship conducted by practitioners usually referred to as 'priests' in an hierarchical organisational structure headed by bishops. Episcopally organised religious groups historically were monopolies within nation states or across larger territories and have only recently become denominational.¹ While an Anglican-dominated Protestant religious institution was hegemonic in Australia until 1947, this has changed demographically with the precipitous decline of Presbyterians, Methodists and Uniting (from 21.3% when taken together in 1947 to 11.3% in 1996) and the rise of Catholics (from 20.7% in 1947 to 27% in 1996) and Orthodox groups (0.2% in 1947 to 2.8% in 1996). In 1947 Anglican and Protestant groups accounted for nearly two-thirds of Australia's population. In 1996 Anglicans and Catholics account for over 50% while Protestant groups made up less than 20%.

Australia's religious institution now can be described as having an Anglican dominated 'episcopal' religious institution which has acquired denominational characteristics.² For example, Australian

¹ W. H. Swatos, *Into Denominationalism: The Anglican Metamorphosis*, Society for Scientific Study of Religion, 1979

² G. D. Bouma (ed.), *Many Religions, All Australian: Religious Settlement, Identity, and Cultural Diversity*, Kew, 1997, Chs 7 and 8.

The End of Religions? Religion in an Age of Globalisation

civic mournings, such as those following the death of Princess Diana, the Thredbo disaster, and the Port Arthur massacre are usually held in Catholic or Anglican cathedrals led by a very religiously diverse group of religious officials and attended by religiously diverse mourners and in this way representing the nation - religiously diverse, yet gathered in prayer under episcopal oversight.

The Protestant presupposition of the religious institution of the United States is made clear in the following examples. When I go to the United States people ask of my religious status and activities by inquiring whether and how often I preach, whereas in Australia the question would be about how often I say mass, or celebrate the Eucharist. Similar echoes of this Protestant presupposition were heard in news reports surrounding plane crash of John F Kennedy Jr. While the Kennedys were grieving, American reporters spoke of a 'minister' holding a 'prayer meeting' for JFK Jr. thereby making Protestant a Catholic rite, as the priest was clearly saying mass.

When I visited the Church of the New Age in Sedona, I observed that it was set out as a Protestant church with rows of chairs focussed on a lectern/pulpit rather than an altar. I was also informed that the worship was 'spontaneous' and not in a printed form or prayerbook. I was also told which events happened and in which order. Gathering, invocation, meditation, reading, meditation, centring and group blessing. Sounds familiar. I am researching Australian New Age groups in order to ascertain whether they are more likely to follow a more sacramental format given the more episcopal and sacramental shape of Australia's religious institution.

A direct comparison provides more evidence of this. The artist Serrano exhibited in both Phoenix, Arizona and Melbourne, Australia. These cities are both about three million in population. In Melbourne, Serrano's piece entitled 'Piss Christ' - a photograph of a crucifix placed in a beaker of what was purported to be urine - caused a huge outcry and furore. Bishops and other church leaders protested, the work was vandalised by ardent Christians, and finally it was withdrawn. The same work went unnoticed in Phoenix, but the good burghers of Phoenix were outraged by another of Serrano's works in which it was necessary to walk on the American flag to move through the exhibition. Clearly in Protestant United States the flag is more of a sacred symbol than the crucifix. Moreover, Protestants do not care about Catholic symbols and images, in this case the crucifix. The Catholic symbol violates the Protestant religious institution. In other cities in the United States where

Globalisation and Localisation

Catholics are strong this may be reversed, indicating that national and global institutions are differently localised.

In these demographic and institutional differences we can see evidence of the fact that in earlier forms of globalisation, the internationalisation of certain European forms of religious life, produced local variations of 'home office' forms of religious organisation and cultus. This depended in part on the demographic composition of the European populations in each place to which European religious forms were exported. The Protestant domination of the United States was in part a product of its origins as a place of religious freedom for oppressed religious dissidents from Britain and then Europe. Massachusetts was for Puritans, Rhode Island for Unitarians, Pennsylvania for Quakers, New Jersey was Presbyterian and Reformed, Maryland and Virginia were for Catholics. The departure of many Anglicans at the end of the Revolutionary War and after the War of 1812 (or the Napoleonic Wars if viewed from a European perspective), left the field clear for the emergence of a Protestant establishment. The settlement of the American West by Methodists, Baptists and Mormons completed this Protestant establishment.¹ Meanwhile in British colonies established around the world, Anglican-dominated Protestant religious institutions with hierarchical and episcopal organisational structures dominated. Each colony has a similar basic story made distinct depending on when and by whom they were settled - English, Scots or Irish. Anglicans may not have been demographically the largest, but by association with the Monarch and military were accorded the greatest legitimacy.

Anglican globalisation

Anglicans globalised in a previous global period of world history (1848-1914). They did so in association with an ascendant political empire, as part of colonising, occupying, and settling forces. While the antecedents of this period were set in the British colonisation of North America, that did not result in an Anglican but a Presbyterian and later Methodist and Baptist hegemony. Until the Revolutionary War, Anglicans in British North America had immense legitimacy in most colonies, but a legitimacy which was due to association with the imposed power of empire rather than the emergent commercial and later industrial power. After 1800, Canada emerged as an

¹ R. Finke and R. Stark, *The Churching of America: 1776-1990*, New Brunswick NJ, 1997.

The End of Religions? Religion in an Age of Globalisation

Anglican-dominated colony with significant Catholic and Presbyterian elements which were often numerically larger but not as powerful, while the United States emerged as a plural Protestant denominational society.

Elsewhere in the world Anglican influence and power increased with the rise of the British Empire after the decline of Napoleonic France. In this case it was the culture of the Empire that provided the dominant institutional framework for localisation. Local customs and patterns were largely overrun by conquering British forces and the overwhelming demographic shift caused by large numbers of settlers. Thus, in Australia indigenous cultures were nearly wiped out and certainly ignored by apparently culturally self-sufficient settlers who transplanted their religious life, acquiring precious little local flavour in the process. For example, a few local Christmas carols were written in the twentieth century, but the hegemonic religious culture for most of Australia after 1788 was centred in London, with every attempt to copy it locally as is so evident in the architecture of Anglican churches. The stories of Canada and New Zealand are minor variations reflecting later settlement, not having been prison colonies (although comparisons between Australia and the American State of Georgia should be made), and having only slightly different ethnic compositions both in terms of settlers and indigenes. Throughout the former empire the Anglican establishment has waned with the setting of the sun of the British Empire.¹ The inertia of both Empire and Church is enormous but how much of either will be left by the end of the next century is an open question particularly in Australia, Canada and New Zealand where the current demographic composition of Anglicans does not auger well for a long and prosperous future.²

A different pattern obtains in the United States. Following a precipitous decline after the Revolutionary War (incurring losses in the percentage wars particularly to Methodists and Baptists), American Anglicans (referred to as Episcopalians), have been comfortably small for over one hundred and fifty years. Episcopalians have declined from a position of power in numbers and cultural legitimacy before the Revolution, to less than 5% of the population for most of the twentieth century, and are now less than

¹ B. N. Kaye, 'Broughton and the Demise of Royal Supremacy', *Journal of the Royal Australian Historical Society*, Vol. 81, 1995, pp. 39-51; and B. N. Kaye, *A Church Without Walls: Being Anglican in Australia*, Melbourne, 1995.

² G. D. Bouma and P. J. Hughes 'Religion and Age in Australia', *People and Place*, Vol. 6, No. 1, 1998, pp. 18-25.

Globalisation and Localisation

2%. Is this the future for Commonwealth Anglicans? Probably not, because the comfortably small group of American Episcopalians are incredibly rich and famous - most Presidents have been Episcopal, and Episcopalians have one of the highest average incomes of any religious group in the United States. This association with the elite and powerful is nowhere near so clear for Commonwealth Anglicans. Moreover, although there is some Anglophilia among Episcopalians, the church has largely indigenised in the United States. Indeed, being a class-oriented denomination is an indicator of successful localisation or indigenisation, since the American religious institution for the last one hundred and fifty years has called for class-differentiated denominations in a way that is not found in the rest of the world.

Pentecostal globalisation

Contemporary Pentecostal forms of Christianity originated in the early twentieth century. While Pentecostals have antecedents in many eras of Christian history and proximal roots in nineteenth century Methodist camp meetings, the focus on Spirit baptism, glossolalia and healing is definitional for contemporary Pentecostalism. A range of meetings in the opening years of the twentieth century compete for the birthplace of this form of Christianity. Whatever their origin, Pentecostal forms of Christianity have spread both organisationally and as a style of worship around the world with steady and considerable growth since 1960s as they have extended from lower class origins to become middle class, urban and highly corporatised. Hughes provides an excellent description of the origin, rise, diversity and organisation of the Pentecostal movement in Australia.¹ Pentecostal growth in Australia is clearly due more to conversion than is the case with mainline Christian groups such as Anglicans.² In Australia, as elsewhere, Pentecostal Christianity is often associated with marginal, oppressed or poorer groups. This explains in part its current appeal in rural Australia.³

The global spread of Pentecostal Christianity in this century is at least as rapid and amazing as the spread of Anglican Christianity was last century. Christianity in Africa, Latin America and

¹ P. J. Hughes, *The Pentecostals in Australia*, Melbourne, 1996.

² *Op. cit.*, p. 65.

³ See P. J. Hughes, *Religion in Australia: Facts and Figures*, Melbourne, 1997, p. 52.

The End of Religions? Religion in an Age of Globalisation

Indigenous America has been transformed by Pentecostal groups. In many places these groups have supplanted, or grown substantially larger than those Christian groups started previously by missionaries from mainstream denominations and Catholics. While initially started by missionaries from Pentecostal groups (usually sent from congregations and denominations in the United States), Pentecostal forms of Christianity have quickly indigenised, taking on local colour and culture rather than trying to become clones of their parent churches as had Anglicans in the previous century. While originating in the United States among the less powerful and oppressed groups, the spread of Pentecostal forms of Christianity has not been assisted by association with *Pax Americana* in the same way that Anglican globalisation was fostered and promoted by the spread of *Pax Britannia*. Neither the state of origin, nor the state of reception actively promoted and underwrote the cost of the spread of Pentecostal Christianity as had been the case for Anglicanism. Rather, the use of global electronic communications technology has sped the spread of Pentecostal groups. These new religious groups usually do reflect the Protestant religious institution of the United States, offering a sermon-based form of worship and being very democratically organised, with no hierarchy and strongly populist orientations. These features accidentally facilitate indigenisation, as local groups work out what it means for them to achieve the aims of Pentecostal Christianity where they live their lives.

Two globalisations, two localisations

Each of the globalisation patterns outlined above are associated with different patterns of localisation which reflect both the institutional context within which the globalisation and localisation occurred and different missiological strategies. The fundamental missiological options available to religious groups intent on spreading their view of God and the world are described by Lamin Saneh¹ as proselytisation or conversion. He argues that proselytisation aims to produce carbon copies, or to use a more current metaphor, clones, of the missioning church and society, while conversion aims to enable the development of an indigenous expression of the core elements of the faith using the culture and environment of the new believers. Proselytisation seeks to globalise along the lines of

¹ L. Saneh, address to Victorian Provincial Conference of the Province of Victoria Anglican Church of Australia, 1999.

Globalisation and Localisation

McDonalds, producing an international array of recognisably badged, virtually identical outlets offering the same product. In contrast, conversion seeks to encourage a local expression of the essential message (product) which is clearly grounded in the lives of people to whom the message is given, expressed using the themes of their culture and not over-defined by head office regulations. The convert is an active recipient, transforming the global message into one that is recognisably local, relevant and immediately available to those of the locale.

Beginning with the sixteenth century colonisation of the New World, the expansion of Christianity in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries was largely a consequence of European colonisation of the globe. Where the armies and navies went, so did chaplains, churches and church schools. In one way or another those colonised were enticed, cajoled, or forced into Christianity, which was seen as a 'civilising' institution, a harbinger of progress and enlightenment. From a policy perspective the churches, but particularly the Anglican Church, were seen as an arm of the state fostering the cultural transformation of the newly acquired lands. In this environment many people associated with them such that they became like their conquerors in culture as well as in governmental structure, economy and other aspects of life.

As a result of this process, the local became a microcosm of the global, a global which itself was unitary. While these strategies were questioned by a few such as Mateo Ricci in the seventeenth and Hudson Taylor in the nineteenth century, and while other exceptions exist, the proselytisation paradigm remains to this day. Until recently the bulk of Christian expansion has been due to the association between Christianity and Christendom, between church and state. This growth was entirely due to a form of colonisation in which indigenous culture, religion and social order were replaced by those of the colonial powers. In this the other became like the missionary; thus the missiological strategy was one of proselytisation.

As the twentieth century progressed, missions became increasingly indigenised (both in fact and in policy) as they became decreasingly associated with European and American powers and foreign policy. The gains of Catholics and mainstream Protestants until 1950 have begun to be supplanted by the growth of Pentecostal groups, many of which were spawned in the areas in which earlier work had been done. Although some initial seeding from foreign missionaries did occur, these communities are largely self-supporting and becoming theologically self-reliant. As a result,

The End of Religions? Religion in an Age of Globalisation

Latin American and African Christians are now predominantly Pentecostal and growing.

The reasons for this growth include, among other things, the zeal of Pentecostals and the fact that the faith they promote is indigenous, being expressed within a local culture. That is, in globalisation they have successfully localised. But in this case the local is not a copy of the global, nor was the branch plant a copy of the home office. The local has become a cultural incarnation of the core elements of the missionising group. Both the local and the global are 'converted' in this process. While Pentecostalism in Australia is quite recognisable as North American, its forms in other less similar cultures are much more varied.

This cannot be said for Anglican, Lutheran and most Catholic religious communities that have been established by European missionaries, colonists and chaplains. These are largely clones of European head offices - Irish Catholics in Boston, Chicago, Melbourne and Sydney; German Lutherans in South Australia, Dutch Reformed in various parts of the world. Anglican churches around the world are identifiable as such and have a sameness which is lauded as a virtue, a sameness which reflects the still hegemonic Englishness of Anglicanism, a sameness reflected in the hymn 'the day thou gave us, lord, is ended'. A sameness reflected in four hundred and fifty years of prayerbook worship. All of this is essentially modern and with the passing of modernity is less relevant, useful and certainly less of a drawing card. These are clearly products of various forms of proselytisation aimed at making 'them' like 'us', or in the case of colonial forms, such as Australia, making 'us' like 'them', the 'them' being the 'real' people at 'home'. Australian religious history can be seen as the attempt to civilise both the 'savage native' and the 'savage convict' through proselytisation, through the active colonisation of both pre-existing cultures by imported religious beliefs and organisations.

The future of Christianity is clearly not with the proselytisers but with the converts and conversion in which both missionary and missionised are challenged and changed in the process. Indigenised Christianity will grow and thrive. Meanwhile, local copies of formerly hegemonic imperial powers and cultures will continue to try to find local inspiration, thieving from indigenous cultures, but turn unsatisfied to their ancient albeit not local roots and wonder why they feel disconnected from the God they brought to the new land they have failed to tame, make meaningful or grow up within.